

Annual Activity Report

Lisa Schwartz, PhD
Arnold L. Johnson Chair in Health Care Ethics
CE&B, Faculty of Health Sciences
2004-2005

August 15, 2005

Preamble:

The year 2004-2005 has been very busy and marked by successes on a number of fronts. The challenge has been to divide time productively and find synergies between projects that enrich as well as facilitate. It has been a year of cultivating collaborations within the university as well as national and international collaborations. New developments have been advanced in research and education, while previous years' objectives have begun to reach fruition.

This years accomplishments:

Faculty Activity:

- Development of MF 1 & 2 for the new COMPASS MD Curriculum stream in Professional Competencies on ethics and moral reasoning.
*The team has been working hard to develop educational materials for the new MD programme. We have revised the McMaster **framework for moral reasoning** developed by Dr Johnson and others in the 1980s and have created a framework for analysis founded on protection of patient autonomy in the social context. The Social Justice Framework was presented at an interdisciplinary conference in Oxford in July and was very well received. An **evaluation program** has also been created with funding support from the Medical Council of Canada. The grant includes co-investigators from the University of Glasgow, colleagues I began educational research work with before coming to McMaster. Two students are continuing electives in health care ethics under my supervision.*
- Provided **faculty development** for Longitudinal Facilitators who will play a major role in the delivery of the ethics content in the new curriculum.
A workshop for the people who will work directly with students on ethics and moral reasoning in health care has been arranged for this autumn. Supportive materials for each of the ethics sessions are in development.
- Bioethics Interest Group (BIG) 2004-2005
Monthly informal discussion of topics related to ethics in health care and biomedical sciences organised and moderated by Lisa Schwartz. This was an

especially exciting year. Speakers were invited from the McMaster community and from abroad. This year's speakers included,

- Graeme Laurie, University of Edinburgh, October 2004
Where autonomy ends and privacy begins: rethinking disclosure dilemmas surrounding familial genetic information
 - Alison Miculan and Lisa Schwartz, McMaster University, December 2004
Where autonomy ends and justice begins: rethinking the primacy of autonomy in health ethics
 - Laurel Evans, McMaster University, January 2005
A Demonstration of a Doctor's Discipline Hearing: What happens if it happens to you? The Complaints and Discipline Process of Regulatory Colleges for Health Professionals
 - Julia Abelson, CHEPA, McMaster University, February 2005
Bringing 'The Public' into Public Coverage Decisions: From Principles to Practice
 - Martin Richards, Family Research and Director of the Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge, England, March 2005
How distinctive is genetic information? Can particular regulatory arrangements be justified?
 - David Rosenbloom, McMaster University and consultant on patient safety and medico-legal matters, April 2005.
A 'Just Culture' for Health Care Errors
 - Michael Coughlin, St Joseph's Hospital & McMaster, May 2005
Reflections on the State of Health Ethics
 - Geoffrey Rockwell Director of Humanities, Computing Centre Multimedia Group School of Arts, McMaster University, June 2005
Blogs: What the Research are they?
-
- **BHSc:** Supervision of two 4th year student projects
Further involvement in the program is under development
 - **Graduate** student education.
I led a reading course in genetics and ethics was offered under the programme that attracted a student from Carlton University. I continue to sit on the PhD committees of students in Philosophy and Nursing.
 - Ethics in Human Research 742* in the Health Research Methodologies (HRM) programme.
This course was offered to PhD and MSc students for the first time this spring. The students did very well and the course was highly evaluated by the group which was comprised of students from the HRM programme and Philosophy.
 - **Post-graduate** medical education.

Multiple area specific workshops have been held with excellent reception. The first of the on-line resources tailored to the educational needs of residents in specific specialties is in the works and should be available soon. The first of these is in Transfusion Medicine.

- **Research** initiatives in health ethics.
As the section under grants and funding demonstrates, this has been a successful year for generating research collaborations. Among the successes is a grant to explore ethical and legal ramifications of non-consented use of archived tissue linked to non-nominative health data. A report has been submitted and publications are being generated on the topic which affects a great number of researchers in the Faculty. This September I am part of a large team grant application out of McMaster and look forward to the interdisciplinary work it will entail.
- Develop a website for ethics in health care for the Faculty of Health Sciences with links to other health care ethics projects and programmes on campus.
This website is under development.

Interfaculty Activity

- Appointed as the representative of the Faculty of Health Sciences to the Faculty of Humanities
This is a new role which I believe can encourage greater collaboration between the faculties.
- Enhance bioethics **collaborations** between FHS and Faculties of Humanities, Divinity and Social Sciences through the development of shared resources and a network for communicating and instigating research efforts in health ethics.
*A strategic initiative assembled a group from throughout the university to respond to **Collaborations for Health**. This created an opportunity to generate stronger links among scholars involved in bioethics education and research on campus. The work continues and we are hopeful will find greater support in the coming years.*

Community activity:

- Work with the newly appointed Clinical Ethicist for Hamilton Health Sciences in developing policy and educational resources for staff and clinicians. *This has included work with the Clinical Ethics Consult team as a consultant and as educator and mentor to the clinical ethicist and to team members.*

Other activities:

Peer reviewed presentations:

- *Ethics of Home Health Care*, Canadian Bioethics Society, Calgary, October 2004

- *On my own? Where autonomy ends and justice begins*, 4th Global Conference: Making sense of health, illness and disease; Mansfield College, Oxford, July 2005

Publications:

Peer Reviewed:

- Goldie J, Schwartz L, Morrison J. Students' attitudes and potential behaviour to a competent patient's request for withdrawal of treatment as they pass through a modern medical curriculum. *Journal of Medical Ethics*. 2004 Aug; 30(4):371-6.
- Goldie J, Schwartz L, Morrison J. The impact of a modern medical curriculum on students' proposed behaviour on meeting ethical dilemmas. *Medical Education* 2004 Sep; 38(9):942-9.
- Goldie J, Schwartz L, Morrison J. Sex and the surgery: students' attitudes and potential behaviour as they pass through a modern medical curriculum. *Journal of Medical Ethics*. 2004 Oct; 30 (5):480-6.
- Goldie J, Schwartz L, McConnachie A, Jolly B, Morrison J. Can students' reasons for choosing set answers to ethical vignettes be reliably rated? Development and testing of a method. *Medical Teacher*. 2004;26(8):713-718.

Non-peer reviewed:

- Schwartz, L et al; Submitted in draft June 23, 2005 to Canadian Breast Cancer Research Alliance *Recommendations and Requirements for an Ethical and Legal Framework of the proposed Canadian Breast Cancer Research Alliance Tissue Microarray*

Research and funding:

1. Gibson E. Austen L.; Dow J.; Schwartz L.; Willison D. *The Development of New Conceptual Paradigms Responding to Privacy and Access Challenges in Health Research*. CIHR/Strategic Initiative RFA; 04/2004-03/2005; \$71,500
2. Willison D. Abelson J.; Charles C.; Schwartz L. *Understand Canadians' attitudes & expectations re: privacy, access to data, and health research – a comparison of survey & citizens' dialogue methods*. CIHR, 04/2004-03/2006
3. Lisa Schwartz Timothy Caulfield; Elaine Gibson; Bartha Maria Knoppers; Nola Reis; Lori Sheremeta; Don Willison: *Proposal for An Ethical and Legal Framework for The Canadian Breast Cancer Research Alliance "National Retrospective Tissue Microarray Resource for Breast Cancer."* CBCRA/NCIC, January 2005 - January 2006; \$41,000
4. Lohfeld L, Schwartz L, Eva K, Goldie J, Morrison J, *A Multi-Centre Trial of the Reliability, Validity and Utility of the EHCQ-2 (Ethics and Health Care Questionnaire, Version 2) to Evaluate Medical Students' Ethical Sensitivity* Medical Council of Canada July 1, 2005 – June 30, 2008 \$149,740.00

5. Dore K, Reiter H, Schwartz L *Evaluation of a Web-Based Instrument to Measure Non-Cognitive Abilities of Medical School Applicants* Medical Council of Canada Research and Development Fund: Single Year Grant \$34,208.00
6. Heddle N, et al *CIHR Team Grant in Blood Management*; successful LOI; application deadline September 2005.

Invited talks:

<i>Research ethics: consent, risk and justice</i>	NCEHR workshop, Halifax	17/11/2004
<i>Ethical issues in cancer care</i>	North Eastern Ontario Cancer Centre, Thunder Bay	11/2004
<i>Tissue banking for research</i>	Lakehead University, Thunder Bay	11/2004
<i>Ethical Issues in Lung Cancer</i>	COPE 2005, Thunder Bay	15-16/4/05
<i>Palliative Care Ethics</i>	Simcoe, ON	07/06/2005
<i>5 Days in palliative Care</i>	Canterbury Hills, Ancaster	01/06/2005

External affiliations:

- Cancer Care Ontario

I was ethics consultant for Cancer Care Ontario between 2000-2005 where I led on the redesign of a document on Informed Consent, as well as traveling throughout the Province to provide ethics education and policy development for the Regional Cancer Centers. This role has now concluded as CCO experiences restructuring, but I continue to have affiliations with CCO around patient safety among other topics.

- Ontario Cancer Research Ethics Board:

Recognizing a need to enhance research ethics in oncology I became a founding member of the Ontario Cancer Research Ethics Board, and was a member of the steering committee for its creation. June 2004 - present

- Canadian Breast Cancer Research Alliance.

Member of the Research Advisory Committee. 2003 – present.

Next year's objectives:

Education:

Continue the development of the ethics component of the COMPASS curriculum.

This includes

- *Getting MF1-3 running with accompanying materials and presentations*
- *Evaluation of ethics in the curriculum for effectiveness and impact as part of the Ethics in Health Care Questionnaire study funded by the MCC*
- *Preparing PC tutors to deliver the ethics and moral reasoning sessions*
- *Participating in student assessment*
- *Review and update of materials*

Broadening postgraduate ethics education.

Creation of a database of materials and leading academic half days and rounds.

Further development of ethics content in the HRM programme

Ethics is acknowledged to be an essential aspect of all HRM student education and I will encourage its development as a member of the HRM restructuring team and participant on a variety of specialized streams. 742 will be offered again in the spring of 2006.*

Research:

- Completion and follow up of existing studies, including presentation of work at the Canadian Bioethics Society conference in October.
- Start of the MCC study on evaluating ethics education in the medical programme.
- Co-investigator on CIHR Team grant application in transfusion medicine.